Declarations of Racism as a Public Health Crisis: Utilizing Declarations to Address Health Inequities

January 21, 2021
How to Use WebEx Q & A

1. Open the Q&A panel
2. Select “All Panelists”
3. Type your question
4. Click “Send”
Moderator

**Betsy Lawton**, J.D., Senior Staff Attorney, Network for Public Health Law—Northern Region Office
Ruqaiijah Yearby, J.D., M.P.H., Professor of Law and Executive Director, Institute for Healing Justice and Equity, Saint Louis University
Presenter

Tia Taylor Williams, M.P.H., C.N.S., Director, APHA Center for Public Health Policy and Center for School Health and Education
Presenter

Zo Mpofu, Public Health Program Consultant & CHA/CHIP Coordinator, Buncombe County Health & Human Services
Presenter

Dawn Hunter, J.D., M.P.H., Deputy Director, Network for Public Health Law—Southeastern Region Office
RACISM IS A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS.
Here’s how to respond.

https://tjcinstitute.com/research/racism-is-a-public-health-crisis/
Ruqaiijah Yearby
J.D., M.P.H.

- Executive Director and Co-Founder of the Institute for Healing Justice and Equity
- Professor of Law and Member of the Center for Health Law Studies
- Professor, Center for Health Care Ethics
Roadmap

- Systemic Racism
- Racism, Law, and the SDOH
- Racism and Economic Stability
- Racism and Public Health
- Racism as a Public Health Crisis
- Declaration Best Practices
Systemic Racism

- Systemic racism refers to a complex array of social structures, interpersonal interactions, and beliefs by which a dominant group categorizes people into "races" and uses its dominance to disempower and devalue other groups and differentially allocate societal resources.

- Racism is about Power.
Forms of Systemic Racism

- **Structural:** refers to the way laws and policies are written or enforced, which advantages the majority, and disadvantages minorities.

- **Institutional:** “neutral” organizational practices and policies that reinforce the racial hierarchy.

- **Interpersonal:** an individual’s conscious and/or unconscious prejudice.
Revised SDOH Framework created by Ruqaijah Yearby (2020)
Racism and Economic Stability

- **Structural racism**: failure to provide paid sick leave, workers compensation, and protections for health and safety to minority workers

- **Institutional racism**: ‘neutral’ decision to use salary history to determine wages

- **Interpersonal racism**: using race or perceived race to determine pay or promotion
Racism and Public Health

- **Structural:** Allocation of resources (masks, personnel, funding) predominately focused on hospital care

- **Institutional:** “neutral” mask mandates that were disproportionately applied against racial and ethnic minorities

- **Interpersonal:** blaming racial and ethnic minorities for disparities
Racism as a Public Health Crisis

❖ Racism in the U.S.
  ➢ Slavery
  ➢ Jim Crow
  ➢ Flint water crisis
  ➢ Opioid Epidemic
  ➢ Police Violence

❖ Declarations
  ➢ Mar. 2020 – July 2020: 84 cities and 42 counties
Declaration Best Practices

- Define Racism
- Use Racial Equity Tools
- Truth and Reconciliation
- Adopt Health Justice Framework
Racial Equity Tools

- Designed to integrate **intentional consideration of racial equity** into governmental decision-making, including laws, policies, practices, programs, and budgets.

- Racial equity tools offer a means by which policymakers can **engage communities** and normalize conversations about race, operationalize new behaviors and policies, and organize to achieve racial equity.
# Citywide Racial Equity Goals & Strategies, City of Portland

## CITYWIDE RACIAL EQUITY GOALS & STRATEGIES

### EQUITY GOAL #1

We will end racial disparities within city government, so there is fairness in hiring and promotions, greater opportunities in contracting, and equitable services to all residents.

### EQUITY GOAL #2

We will strengthen outreach, public engagement, and access to City services for communities of color and immigrant and refugee communities, and support or change existing services using racial equity best practices.

### EQUITY GOAL #3

We will collaborate with communities and institutions to eliminate racial inequity in all areas of government, including education, criminal justice, environmental justice, health, housing, transportation, and economic success.

## OVERALL STRATEGIES

1. **Use a racial equity framework:**
   Use a racial equity framework that clearly articulates racial equity; implicit and explicit bias; and individual, institutional, and structural racism.

2. **Build organizational capacity:**
   Commit to the breadth and depth of institutional transformation so that impacts are sustainable. While the leadership of electeds and officials is critical, changes take place on the ground, through building infrastructure that creates racial equity experts and teams throughout the city government.

3. **Implement a racial equity lens:**
   Racial inequities are not random; they have been created and sustained over time. Inequities will not disappear on their own. It is essential to use a racial equity lens when changing the policies, programs, and practices that perpetuate inequities, and when developing new policies and programs.

4. **Be data driven:**
   Measurement must take place at two levels—first, to measure the success of specific programmatic and policy changes; and second, to develop baselines, set goals, and measure progress. Using data in this manner is necessary for accountability.

5. **Partner with other institutions and communities:**
   Government work on racial equity is necessary, but insufficient. To achieve racial equity in the community, government needs to work in partnership with communities and institutions to achieve meaningful results.

6. **Operate with urgency and accountability:**
   When change is a priority, urgency is felt and change is embraced. Building in institutional accountability mechanisms using a clear plan of action will allow accountability. Collectively, we must create greater urgency and public commitment to achieve racial equity.
Truth and Reconciliation

As the W.K. Kellogg Foundation notes, transformational and sustainable change must include “ways for all of us to heal from the wounds of the past, to build mutually respectful relationships across racial and ethnic lines that honor and value each person’s humanity, and to build trusting intergenerational and diverse community relationships that better reflect our common humanity.”
Health Justice Framework

- Declarations must address systemic racism by **structurally changing the systems** that cause racial inequalities.
- Declarations must include **financial supports and accommodations**.
- Racial and ethnic minorities must be **engaged and empowered** to take the lead in developing interventions.
Additional Readings


Racism is a public health crisis.

January 21, 2021
TIA TAYLOR WILLIAMS, MPH, CNS
Director
Center for Public Health Policy
Center for School, Health and Education
What Is a Public Health Crisis?

- Affects large numbers of people
- Threatens health over the long-term
- Requires the adoption of large-scale solutions

Source: Sandro Galea, MD, MPH, DrPH, School of Public Health, Boston University
Racism: A Public Health Crisis

• Affects large numbers of people
  ▪ Growing demographic of communities of color; concentrated poverty; opportunity/income/wealth gap

• Threatens health over the long-term
  ▪ Disparities in life expectancy; rates of chronic disease; maternal and infant mortality

• Requires the adoption of large-scale solutions
  ▪ Policy and systems changes vs. individual intervention
Declarations of Racism as Public Health Crisis

- Over 170 declarations adopted since 2019
- Four states: MI, MN, NV, WI
- 97 Cities, 69 Counties
- Governors, Mayors, County Executives, City and Town Councils, Board of Health, School districts
• Racism (vs. race) as a social determinant of health; driver for poor health outcomes and health disparities

Boston (MA): Racism is threat to public health and safety, and is a paramount social determinant of health, shaping access to the resources that create opportunities for health, including public safety, housing, education and employment, and is a persistent barrier to health equity for all Bostonians;
• Historical and present-day impact of structural racism

Michigan Governor’s Executive Order: Racism has existed in America for over 400 years. From the genocide of Indigenous peoples upon the arrival of the Europeans, to chattel slavery beginning in the 1600s, to the Jim Crow era... Historical racism in Michigan has affected people of color who reside in the state. For example, discriminatory housing practices in the 20th century, such as redlining and exclusionary housing covenants, contributed to segregation and created an obstacle to the transfer of generational wealth.
Data and accountability

- San Bernardino County (CA): created a diverse Equity Element Group to identify programs and policies to address the impacts of racism.

- Holyoke (MA): established a Citizen Police Advisory Committee, with the power to request information from the Police Department to inform them to provide recommendations to the Mayor.

Community engagement

- Dekalb County (GA): Racial equity training for community partners, grantees, vendors, and contractors
Actions

Racial equity specific policies and programs

• Minneapolis (MN): Evaluate City Charter and all Cities policies and procedures to prioritize racial equity

• Allegheny County (PA): Advocate for policies that improve health for communities of color, including the “Black Mamas Matter” policy agenda

Funding

• Boston (MA): Redirects $12 million from police overtime funds to equity and inclusion efforts, including new funds for the Boston Public Health Commission

• Minneapolis (MN): Requests allocation of funds for small business development, housing, and community-based infrastructure. Sustainable fund for youth development.
What’s missing? Preliminary analysis

• Justice oriented language
• Racial healing
• More specificity about entities/agencies; cross-sector collaboration
• Funding and resource allocations
Declarations of Racism as a Public Health Issue

Across the country, local and state leaders are declaring racism a public health crisis or emergency. These declarations are an important first step in the movement to advance racial equity and justice and must be followed by allocation of resources and strategic action.

Below is the growing list of states, cities and counties that are naming racism as a determinant of health. Have a declaration to add? Please let us know.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ARIZONA</th>
<th>CALIFORNIA</th>
<th>COLORADO</th>
<th>CONNECTICUT</th>
<th>FLORIDA</th>
<th>GEORGIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Webinar series
DECLARATIONS OF RACISM AS A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS/ISSUE

COMING SOON

Map of declarations

Select state

States colored by declaration count: 1-30+ © Mapbox © OpenStreetMap Improve this map
DECLARATIONS OF RACISM AS A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS/ISSUE

Type of declaring entity:  
- All levels (171)  
- State (5)  
- City (97)  
- County (69)  

- Health/Public Health Entity (32)  
- City/Town Council (123)  
- Other (2)  
- Education Entity (2)  
- Governor/ Mayoral Statement (12)  

Ohio (24)

- Akron City Council and Akron Mayor  
- Athens City Council  
- Butler County Health District  
- Canton City Council  
- Cincinnati City Council  
- Cleaveland City Council

Ohio: 24 declarations

[Map of Ohio showing various city councils and health entities with links and a logo of APHA]
DECLARATIONS OF RACISM AS A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS/ISSUE

States colored by declaration count: 1

- Akron City Council and Akron Mayor
- Stow City Council
- Lake County Health Department
- Flint City Council of Commissioners
- Genesee County Board of Supervisors
- Milwaukee County Board of Supervisors
- St. Joseph County Board of Health
- Indianapolis (Marion County) City-county council
- Evansville City Council
- Champaign School District
- Bloomfield Township Commission
- Beverly Mayor
- Bridgeport City Council
- Chautauqua County Board of Supervisors
- Anne Arundel Executive and Board of County Commissioners
- Buncombe County Health
- Pitt County Board of Commissioners
- Champaign School District
- Chautauqua County Board of Supervisors
- Buncombe County Health
- Pitt County Board of Commissioners

Akron City Council and Akron Mayor

With approval from Akron City Council, Mayor declared racism a public health crisis

Declared on 6/3/2020
Racism: Science & Tools for the Public Health Professional

- Purchase at: www.apha.org/racism-book
- Earn up to 15 continuing education credits
ADVANCING RACIAL EQUITY

Six part webinar series on racism as a driving force of social determinants.

Topics include reproductive justice, policing, racial healing, housing, environmental justice.

http://www.apha.org/racial-equity
Advancing Racial Equity Series: Discussion Guide (Part I)

- Reflection and discussion questions
- Activities/exercises
- Resources

https://www.apha.org/racial-equity
THANK YOU

Tia.Taylor@apha.org

APHA racism resources:
http://www.apha.org/racism
Community Health Improvement: Messaging & Action Tools for Equity

Presented by

Zo Mpofu – Buncombe County Public Health

January 21, 2021
- Togiyasdi -
Where They Race

Buncombe County
Asheville, NC
Buncombe County: Building a Culture of Health
RWJF 2014 Culture of Health Prize Winner

- Access
- Healthy Eating
- Prevention
## Systems Change Approaches

*Addressing Complexity with Multiple Actors*

### Collective Impact (3.0)

Adaptive vs. Technical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>6 Foundations – Tamarack Institute</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• From “Management” to Movement Building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• From “Common Agenda” to Community Aspiration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• From “Shared Measurement” to Container for Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• From “Mutually Reinforcing Activities” to High-Leverage Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Continuous Communication” to Community Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Backbone” to Container for Change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Results Based Accountability (RBA)

Moving from Talk to Action

**Core Principles**

- Common Ground—Start with a focus on the result in mind
- Common Language—Use clear, simple words inclusive with agreed upon meaning
- Common Sense—RBA uses a step-by-step thinking process that is straight-forward and easy to follow.

**Key Questions:**

- How much?
- How well?
- Is anyone better off?

### Developmental Evaluation (DE)

Learning from Change

**Supporting Social Innovation**

- **Purpose**: What is emerging as innovation takes shape?
- **Results**: DE nurtures learning
- **What variations in effects are we seeing?**
- **Complexity & Uncertainty** – staying in touch, power sharing
- **Standards**: system thinking, creativity, open/agile
The Toolbox

Communications
- Gamification
- Policy Link – Equity Index
- Equity Elevator: 27-9-3

Policy
- PAIR of ACEs Model
- Targeted Universalism
- Moral Foundations Theory
From Data to Policy Change

2020 Policy Change Time Line

- **June 26th**: Buncombe County Health & Human Services Declares Racism a Public Health Crisis
- **July 14th**: Asheville City Council Passes Community Reparations Resolution.
- **August 4th**: Buncombe County Board of Commissioners and Asheville City Council pass reparations legislation, declare racism a public health and safety crisis.

Buncombe County staff and partners presented local health and justice data that illustrated a clear disparity in outcomes for people of color in our community. This data compelled the approval of declarations by the Health & Human Services Board and Justice Resources Advisory Council, along with a request for a comprehensive Board resolution elevating and confirming the crisis. These actions and the study’s findings led the Board of Commissioners to approve a resolution declaring racism a Public Health and Safety Crisis in Buncombe County during its meeting on Aug. 4.
Equity Action Plan: Components

Community Goals

- Create pathways to ensure engagement in racial equity strategies and improve quality of life
- Provide racial equity education and communication to the community
- Improving quality of life outcomes through racial equity initiatives

Foundational Goals

- Cultivate a thriving workforce within Buncombe County that ensures racial equity
- Institute organizational policies and processes to ensure equity and accountability
- Establish Buncombe County as an equity inclusion model
Lessons Learned in Systems Transformation

• Planning: Acknowledge assessment fatigue & extraction

• Implementation: Proximity and Connection Before Content

• Evaluation: Disaggregated data and Asset-based language
Thank You
Analyzing State and Local Action to Address Systemic Racism

Presented January 21, 2021
Dawn Hunter, JD, MPH
Deputy Director, Network for Public Health Law – Southeastern Region
Overview

» State and Federal Efforts
» Local Efforts
» Summary of Recommended Actions
» Examples of Racial Equity Tools
State Efforts to Address Racism in 2020

» **Eight states** introduced resolutions declaring racism a public health crisis (CA, OH, NY, AZ, MI, MN, NJ, VA)

» **Two states** introduced related resolutions: to study racism in the public education system (LA) and to address racism associated with coronavirus (NJ)

» **Two states** introduced bills to establish working groups to address racial equity (NY and NJ)

» **Twenty-four states and at least twelve cities or counties** established COVID-19 health equity task forces (largely by administrative action but some by Executive Order)
COVID-19 Health Equity Task Forces
Legislative Activity as of January 18, 2021

Bills addressing:

- Racism as a public health crisis or emergency
- Educational inequities
- Data collection and use
- Provider education and training
- Infrastructure
- The history and impact of racism
Federal Efforts to Address Racism in 2020

» **Bill vs. Resolutions**
  
  » **HR990** – Recognizing racism as a national crisis and the need for a truth and reconciliation process (introduced 6/4/2020)
  
  » **HR1069/SR655** – Declaring racism a public health crisis (introduced 7/29 and 7/22/2020, respectively)
  
  » **HB8178/SB4533** – Anti-Racism in Public Health Act of 2020 (introduced 9/4 and 9/8/2020, respectively)
  
  » **HB7618/SB4248** – COVID-19 Bias and Anti-Racism Training Act of 2020 (introduced 7/16 and 7/21/2020, respectively)
Federal Efforts in 2021

The Biden Administration has issued several plans:

- Improve Racial Economic Equity
- Strengthen Tribal Nations
- Empower and Protect Women
- The Biden Plan for Racial and Ethnic Communities (Black, Indian American, AAPI, Jewish, Muslim American, Latino)
- Strengthen Rural America
- Invest in Housing
Local Declarations of Racism as a Public Health Crisis or Emergency

More than 180 declarations have been introduced or adopted across state and local government, non-profits, higher education.

Important Components:
- Clear commitment
- Measures of Accountability
- Emphasis on Community


Source: @alexbhill on Twitter
Analysis of Declarations Made by Local Government Entities in Each Network Region

- Eastern: 16
- Mid-States: 64
- Northern: 49
- Southeastern: 43
- Western: 18
Diving into Local Declarations

**Typical Components:**
- A clear declaration that racism is a public health crisis or emergency
- Measures pertaining to organizational policy or practice
- Emphasis on partnerships and collaboration
- Accountability measures
- Focus on a specific issue
- A call to action to other local, state, and national leaders

**New Analysis Also Includes:**
- Infrastructure proposals
Examples of Recommended Actions

- Collecting and reporting data related to race/ethnicity and using data to inform action.
- Assessing internal policies and procedures using a racial equity framework.
- Developing racial equity action plans with clear goals and timelines.
- Establishing an office and/or position dedicated to health or racial equity.
- Offering educational trainings to expand employees’ understanding of the impacts of racism.
- Creating task forces and oversight committees on race and equity.
- Requiring inclusion, incorporation, and engagement of impacted communities in decision-making processes or in advisory roles.
- Supporting community-led initiatives.
A Deeper Look at Racial Equity Tools

» Use racial equity tools for law, policy, program, and budget review
  ▪ Racial equity impact assessment
  ▪ Equity assessment framework
  ▪ Health impact assessment
### Types of Laws and Policies to Evaluate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State and Local Government</th>
<th>Community Groups and Organizations</th>
<th>Health Care Delivery Organizations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housing (Zoning, Landlord-Tenant Laws, Affordability and Stability, Nuisance Laws)</td>
<td>Safe Streets (traffic, pedestrian)</td>
<td>Data collection and use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Health Measures (Alcohol Outlet Density, Tobacco Control)</td>
<td>Community Advisory Boards and Committees</td>
<td>Funding programs and initiatives that address the social determinants of health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement, Contracting, Grants (include equity language)</td>
<td>Allocation of Tax Dollars</td>
<td>Language, literacy, and accessibility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
King County, WA

**EQUITY IMPACT REVIEW PROCESS**

1. **Scope**

2. **Assess Equity & Community Context**

3. **Analysis & Decision Process**

4. **Implement**

5. **Ongoing Learning**

Did you...

1. Clearly define the issue?
2. Identify the relevant law or policy?
3. Engage community voices or impacted stakeholders?
4. Assess the historical context?
5. Identify the benefits and burdens on vulnerable populations?
6. Identify the outcomes?
7. Consider alternatives to achieve the same outcomes?
8. Plan for implementation, monitoring, and future review?

Network for Public Health Law
### Crosscheck Question:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How is racism operating here?</th>
<th>Potential solutions to address this</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structures:</strong> the who?, what?, when? and where? of decisionmaking</td>
<td>e.g. Composition of Board, senior leadership, managers, school deans, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policies:</strong> the written how?</td>
<td>e.g. Is there alignment of organizational policies and stated values/mission? Are there inherent biases within policies? Is there transparency about how policies are made and enforced?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Practices and Norms:</strong> the unwritten how?</td>
<td>e.g. Who is leading anti-racism or racial equity efforts? Is the practice of anti-racism or racial equity ongoing and embedded across the organization? Is there a system for accountability?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Values:</strong> the why?</td>
<td>e.g. Is there a hierarchy of valution by race or ethnicity, work role, education level or discipline?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **National Association of Chronic Disease Directors – Moving to Institutional Equity**

- **APHA Advancing Racial Equity Discussion Guide**
Ensuring Equity in COVID-19 Planning, Response, and Recovery Decision Making:

**AN EQUITY LENS TOOL FOR HEALTH DEPARTMENTS**

Human Impact Partners and Big Cities Health Coalition, December 2020
You Issued a Declaration – Now What?

» Establish a task force or working group.

» Evaluate and then change policies, practices, or laws to advance racial equity, and monitor implementation.

» Incorporate racial equity into performance management.

» Strengthen data collection and evaluation, including requirements for reporting.

» Allocate funds to specific programs or initiatives.

» Partner with philanthropy, especially around education and community-led initiatives.

» Normalize conversations about race and health.

» Build capacity of staff, volunteers, and teams.

» Use tools in concert with other resources and systematize their use.
Supporters

The Network for Public Health Law is a national initiative of the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation.
How to Use WebEx Q & A

1. Open the Q&A panel
2. Select “All Panelists”
3. Type your question
4. Click “Send”
Thank you for attending

For a recording of this webinar and information about future webinars, please visit networkforphl.org/webinars

Upcoming Events:
2021 Public Health Law Conference: Building and Supporting Healthy Communities for All
September 21 – 23, 2021 | Baltimore, MD